Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To:	Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru:	Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From:	Bradley Fister, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date:	November 16, 2022

Case No: 22-COA-0251
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2354, 2356, 2358 Grinstead Dr.
2421, 2423 Glenmary Ave.

Owner: LCS Yorktown, LLC
710 Barrett Ave. Suite 201
Louisville, KY 40204

Applicant: Louisville Collegiate School
2427 Glenmary Ave.
Louisville, KY 40204

Representative: Nick Pregliasco
Bardenwerper, Talbott and Roberts PLLC
1000 N Hurstbourne Parkway, second floor
Louisville, KY 40223
nrp@bardlaw.net

Plan Prepared by: John Carman
400 E. Main Street Unit 106
Louisville, KY 40202
859-254-9803
jcarman@carmansite.com

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:
The applicant proposes to demolish three, two-story, approximately 10,600 sq. ft, circa 1960 apartment buildings, each with 16 one-bedroom units, to create a 56-vehicle parking lot. The proposed parking lot is to provide off street parking for the Louisville Collegiate School, and would be accessible from the existing ingress/egress to the apartment complex along Grinstead Dr.

This parking lot is part of a larger, conceptual plan to relieve traffic strain on Glenmary Ave. While the plan is still conceptual at this time, it shows a new driveway off Glenmary Ave. that flows traffic to the proposed new parking lot with access to Grinstead Dr.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application
The application was received on October 7, 2022, and it was determined on October 10, 2022 that the application would require committee review. Staff had the application reviewed by both Planning & Design's Transportation Team as well as the Board of Zoning Adjustment Team. It was determined on November 8, 2022 that the application did meet all LDC requirements. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on November 30, 2022 at 4:30 pm, in-person at 444 S. 5th Street, Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines
The following design guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Demolition** and **Site.** The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background
The R7 zoned property within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District, is located on the east side of Grinstead Dr., three lots north of Grinstead Ct. The three circa 1960, two-story, brick clad apartment buildings provide a total of 48 one-bedroom apartments. The Colonial Revival Style apartments have shingled hipped roofs, coined corners, segmental brick arched windows, brick sills, concrete patios for the first-level units, and wooden balconies for the second-level units.

These buildings are a later construction in the district and are currently not eligible for historic rehabilitation tax credits since they were built circa 1960, outside of the Period of Significance on the National Register of Historic Places Historic District nomination. While they are still historic in age and physically located within the National Register District and the Preservation District boundaries, these buildings are not considered contributing. Based on research, these buildings do not have historic significance relating to the architectural, cultural, and/or developmental history of Cherokee Triangle. Their demolition will not have an adverse effect on the historic integrity of the District as a whole.

Conclusions
The Demolition Design Guidelines state, "Unless the City (Metro Louisville Government) has determined that it poses an imminent threat to life or property, do not demolish any historic structure or part of a historic structure that contributes to the integrity of any historic district, or any individual landmark or part of an individual landmark unless:

1) The demolition will not adversely affect the landmark's distinctive characteristics taken as a whole, retained over time."
2) "The demolition will not adversely affect the district's importance as a unified entity composed of interrelated resources united historically or aesthetically by plan or physical development."

3) "The proposed replacement structure and development will strengthen the viability of the district as a whole." (See attached Economic Hardship Exemption and Guidelines for Demolition)

The three circa 1960 apartment buildings are noncontributing to the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District. These are modest, utilitarian structures, characteristic of the construction of late mid-century apartment structures during this time period. There are better apartment examples in the District, from the same era, that convey the history of Cherokee Triangle. The *Demolition Guidelines* provide guidance to evaluate a proposed loss of an historic building. Given that these specific buildings lack architectural, cultural, and/or historic significance, the demolition will not adversely affect the District's distinctive characteristics or importance as a developed neighborhood.

Staff recommends the applicant complete the Kentucky Historic Properties Survey Form and provide them to staff and the Kentucky Heritage Council, along with photographic documentation (including interior) prior to demolition. While the buildings are noncontributing, they are still part of the District and should be documented prior to demolition. Furthermore, the applicant shall notify staff of an excavation schedule for the site, and if archaeological discoveries such as artifacts, features, and other archaeological deposits are found during demolition and construction of the parking lot.

The applicant shall submit a comprehensive landscape and lighting plan that meets the design requirements, includes perimeter landscaping, and includes new parking landscaping. The design for the lighting and landscape plans shall be as unobtrusive as possible and minimize the impact of the lighting and parking on the historic setting and surrounding historic structures. Generally, at least 20% of the proposed parking lot surface area must be unpaved and planted. Any proposed screening walls, fencing, gates, etc. will need to be reviewed and approved by staff prior to construction. Per **Site** Design Guideline **ST1** applicant shall use historic mix concrete for any sidewalks, curbing, or apron installed in public view. The applicant proposes 6 parking spaces to be located at the rear of the property which meets **ST5.**

This parking lot is part of a larger, conceptual plan to relieve traffic strain on Glenmary Ave. While the plan is still conceptual at this time, it shows a new driveway off Glenmary Ave. that flows traffic to the proposed new parking lot with access to Grinstead Dr. As this plan is finalized, it shall be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to work taking place. Additional COA applications may be required for portions of the plan once finalized.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**:

1. **The existing buildings shall not be demolished until all parking lot approvals are issued, and a Kentucky Historic Properties Survey Form has been submitted to staff and the Kentucky Heritage Council.**
2. **The applicant shall notify staff of an excavation schedule for the site and if/when archaeological discoveries such as artifacts, features, and other archaeological deposits are found during demolition and construction of the parking lot**

3. **Final landscaping details shall be submitted to staff for review and approval. The plan must include the parking lot and show proposed and existing trees and landscaping. A copy of the LDC required Landscape Plan will suffice.**
4. **Any proposed screening walls, fencing, gates, etc. shall be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to construction.**
5. **Prior to installation, final exterior lighting fixture details shall be submitted to staff for review and approval and shall include cut sheets for all exterior lighting fixtures.**
6. **Signage was not reviewed as part of this application. Any signage shall be reviewed and approved under a separate application(s) prior to installation.**
7. **Historic concrete mix shall be used for all sidewalks, curbing, or apron installed in public view.**
8. **The removal of any trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open space shall require review, unless directed by the city arborist in cases of emergency or other reasons of public safety.**
9. **Once the applicant finalizes the conceptual traffic plan, they shall submit it to staff for review and final approval prior to work taking place. Additional COA applications may be required.**
10. **If the design or scope of the project changes in any way, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.**

Bradley Fister
Bradley Fister
Planning & Design Coordinator

11-17-2022
Date

DEMOLITION

Design Guideline Checklist
From Economic Hardship Exemption

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

Introduction
Unless the city has determined that it poses an imminent threat to life or property, do not demolish any historic structure or part of a historic structure that contributes to the integrity of any historic district, or any individual landmark or part of an individual landmark.

Demolition by Neglect
The deteriorated condition of a historic building attributable to the owner's failure to provide proper maintenance over an extended period of time will not be considered a mitigating circumstance in evaluations of economic hardship. Hardship that is attributable to a building's being allowed to deteriorate will be considered self-imposed; restoration costs incurred to remediate such neglect will not be considered.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
DE1	Do not demolish existing non-contributing buildings and additions in a manner that will threaten the integrity of existing contributing structures.	+	Buildings are considered noncontributing to the District.
DE2	Do take steps to assure the integrity of a wall exposed to the elements by the removal of a non-historic addition.	NA	Demolition of the entire 3 structures is proposed.
DE3	Do remove non-historic interior finishes such as plaster, drywall, or paneling that may be exposed as a result of the removal of non-historic additions.	NA	
DE4	Do infill non-historic openings in historic walls, exposed as a result of the removal of the non-historic finishes.	NA	
DE5	Do landscape areas that are left vacant as the result of removals of non-contributing buildings and additions. Topography should be made consistent with that of adjacent properties. The slope and grades of land left vacant after demolition should continue and be consistent with those features on adjacent properties.	NA	
DE6	Do take measures to reestablish the street wall after demolition through the use of low fences, walls, and/or vegetation.	+/-	The proposed site plan includes landscaping. However, there need to be more details on the screening.

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+/-	Three structures will be demolished for a new parking area. The design of the parking area is generally complementary to the surrounding properties.
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any re-platting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	See conditions of approval
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+/-	The proposed parking lot would be located at the side of the main Collegiate buildings. However, this whole parcel will be parking.
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+/-	The proposed parking lot would likely require regrading of the entire lot, and it is visible from the street.
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NSI	The applicant shall provide staff with a plan as to how the proposed regrading of the property will take place.
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	See conditions of approval.
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	

ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NSI	There are lines on the plan that appear to be fencing, however none has been provided to staff for review at this time. See conditions of approval.
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NSI	There are lines on the plan that appear to be fencing, however none has been provided to staff for review at this time. See conditions of approval.
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NSI	See conditions of approval
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	+	See conditions of approval.
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NSI	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	Trees have not been proposed to be removed at this time. See conditions of approval.
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	